

WEST AFRICA UNIQUE IDENTIFICATION FOR REGIONAL INTEGRATION AND INCLUSION (WURI) PROJECT

Terms of Reference

Engagement of a Firm to Conduct an Assessment and Develop a Regional Strategy and Roadmap for Cross-border Foundational Identity Systems Interoperability and Mutual Recognition of Foundational Identity Credentials for Access to Services

A. Background

- 1. ECOWAS Member States, specifically Benin, Burkina Faso, Côte d'Ivoire, Guinea, Niger, and Togo are currently implementing a multiphase programme with an overall Programme Development Objective (PrDO) of increasing the number of persons in participating countries who have government-recognized proof of unique identity that facilitates their access to services. This Multiphase Programmatic Approach (MPA), financed by the World Bank, is currently being implemented over phases with Côte d'Ivoire, Guinea and the Commission being part of Phase 1 approved in 2018, and Phase 2, covering Benin, Burkina Faso, Niger, and Togo approved in 2020.
- 2. The programme, which relies on the ECOWAS Protocol of Free Movement of Persons, takes a series of national perspectives allowing countries to join when they are ready, and to join at different implementation levels so far as they subscribe to the same PrDO, take the same basic approach, and adhere to the Principles of Identification for Sustainable Development. The Programme has three main components, structured through country-level operations:

- a. *Strengthening the legal and institutional framework:* Under this component, the programme will finance the preparation, development, and implementation of the legal and institutional framework necessary to structure robust, interoperable foundational ID (*f*ID) systems across participating countries. Fundamentally, this component will finance the development of laws creating a universal, *f*ID system for all persons in the territory state and being uniquely identified in an unintelligible way (i.e., the Unique Identification Number (UNI) is unique and random).
- b. *Establishing robust and reliable foundational ID systems:* Under this component, the creation of flD systems based on issuing UINs linked to biometric data, collected in accordance with international quality standards, will be developed.
- c. *Enabling access to services through fIDs*: Under this component, support will be given to linking the above-developed *f*ID systems to public and private service delivery, both nationally and across participating countries.
- 3. The programme aims to establish interoperable *f*ID systems in the participating ECOWAS Member States which will serve as one path towards the effective deployment and implementation of the ECOWAS National Biometric ID Card (ENBIC) system as adopted by the Authority of Heads of State and Government in 2014 for intra-regional mobility. While the financing of *f*ID systems will be done at the country level, allowing linkages to country-level services, the overall regional programme coordination will be done through the ECOWAS Commission. The Commission's role as a regional governing body is critical for ensuring the interoperability of Member States *f*ID systems and mutual recognition of credentials. Specifically, the aim is to enhance and foster inter-agency collaboration and strengthen regional engagement across ECOWAS Member States through the facilitation of dialogue for mutual recognition of *f*ID systems.

B. Rationale

4. Despite high level of intra-regional mobility estimated at 70 percent of the population, about 196 million people (53 percent of the population) are unregistered and do not have proof of identification¹. The lack of identification limits people's access to critical services and becoming full members of society; with exclusion being worst for the poorest.² Identification can serve as a key enabler for eradicating poverty and for achieving a broad range of development outcomes. Target 16.9 of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) recognises the centrality of proof of identification in assuring an inclusive world: to "provide legal identity for all, including birth registration" by 2030.

¹ ID4D, Global Dataset, 2017, https://data.worldbank.org/data-catalog/id4d-dataset.

² Ditto

- 5. One of two different perspectives is typically taken for ID systems: either a broad, nationwide ID perspective, or a narrow, sectoral one, wherein functional identity credentials are used to deliver services, and thus leads to a fragmented, untrustworthy identification landscape with substantial inefficiencies and costs for both the private and public sectors. Issuing a series of single-use, functional identity credentials—at every point of service delivery—is costly, administratively inefficient and undermines effectiveness, with the negative effects being disproportionately borne by the poor and marginalised groups.
- 6. Further, multiple, parallel identification systems result in poor data, confusion, and duplicative spending of scarce resources. For instance, in 2015, one-off voter registration systems cost African states approximately US\$1.4 billion. These costs include the production of biometric identity cards. Costs typically range from US\$5–10 per card but can go as high as US\$46 (in Côte d'Ivoire); in Nigeria, a one-off biometric, voter-registration exercise cost US\$8.6 per voter and totaled approximately US\$627 million yet registered only 70 million voters of its roughly 95 million eligible voters (less than 74%).³
- 7. The proposed flD systems will provide unique identification of individuals and government-recognised flD credentials, without connoting legal status⁴ upon which both the public and private sector can subsequently rely for transactions and service delivery. Typically, flD systems integrate/are linked with civil registration (CR) systems and interoperate with sectoral systems (*e.g.*, social protection, health, education, financial services, population, or travel). Increasing access to identity and building unified identification systems is beneficial at all levels the individual, the state, and the region. flD systems can reduce overall costs to government and to beneficiaries by eliminating unnecessary spending on fragmented functional ID systems; improve access to, and quality of frontline programmes such as cash transfers and pensions; reduce errors of inclusion and exclusion; and improve monitoring and resolution of error, fraud, and corruption. As such, assistance is more likely to reach intended beneficiaries.
- 8. At the regional level, establishing *f*ID systems that are interoperable across ECOWAS Member States would yield both domestic and regional benefits due to the free movement of persons. The systems would ensure secure and seamless interactions for public and private sectors, thus having the potential of expanding access to services, unleashing a powerful cascade of public and private resources, consequently enabling positive development outcomes. ECOWAS Member States are all at different stages of

³ Alan Gelb, Anna Diofasi. Biometric Elections in Poor Countries: Wasteful or a worthwhile investment? Center for Global Development, https://www.cgdev.org/sites/default/files/biometric-elections-poor-countries-wasteful-or-worthwhile-investment.pdf. For population statistics in Nigeria, *see* ID4D Global Dataset, at *https://data.worldbank.org/data-catalog/id4d-dataset*.

⁴ Some identification systems, such as the national ID programmes of Peru, Pakistan and many other countries, are linked to national status, while others are not. India's Aadhaar system, for example, has de-linked the concept of nationality from identification in order to establish the uniqueness of the country's 1.2 billion residents and create a platform for secure authentication by third parties for service delivery. *See* Gelb & Clark (2013). Aadhaar means "foundation" or "base".

design or development in (i) establishing their own robust legal and institutional frameworks, (ii) building flD systems to register, deduplicate based on biometrics and issue UNI and credentials to individuals, and (iii) enabling authentication processes for access to services through interoperability. Given these realities, the WURI programme aims to build robust flD systems with authentication processes and legal and regulatory frameworks that allow for mutual recognition across the region.

9. It is against this background and within the context of the World Bank financing that the ECOWAS Commission is engaging the service of a Firm to undertake amongst other things the following: (1) conduct a situational assessment of flD systems, functional identification, and governance and coordination frameworks in all fifteen (15) ECOWAS Member States with the objective of producing an assessment and analysis report of ECOWAS Member States national identity ecosystem, (2) develop a regional strategy for flD systems interoperability and mutual recognition of flD credentials for access to services and (3) develop a roadmap for cross-border flD systems interoperability and mutual recognition of flD credentials for access to the regional consensus building process and is intended to support the ECOWAS Member States make informed decision on the regional agenda.

C. Scope of Work

- 10. The Firm will be hold extensive consultation with stakeholders in: Benin, Burkina Faso, Cabo Verde, Côte d'Ivoire, Ghana, Guinea, Guinea Bissau, Liberia, Mali, Niger, Nigeria, The Gambia, Senegal, Sierra Leone, and Togo for the purpose of this assignment and thereafter synthesise the findings into one document.
- 11. While the assessment and analysis report, and strategy will cover all the fifteen (15) ECOWAS Member States, the roadmap will focus on the WURI implementing Member States (Benin, Burkina Faso, Côte d'Ivoire, Guinea, Niger, and Togo).
- 12. The assignment will be conducted taking into cognisance the three official languages spoken in the region.

D. Job Description

- 13. This assignment will be undertaken in parallel with a stakeholders' assessment and will entail coordination between the Firm undertaken the assignment, the Project Implementation Units in the WURI implementing Member States and the Commission.
- 14. The assignment must not infringe on the accomplishments in the WURI implementing Member States. Rather, considerations should be given to the accomplishments and plans that have been established in these countries.

15. More specifically, the Firm will be required to perform the following keys tasks, amongst others:

15.1 Phase 1: Assessment and Analysis Report of ECOWAS Member States National Identity Ecosystem

- a. Undertake an assessment of the identity systems in each Member State and drawing from the appropriate sessions of the Guidelines for ID4D Diagnostics, prepare an overview of the flD systems indicating the stage of digitalization each country is at, inclusive of coverage whilst also integrating the recent countries-specific ID4D diagnostics/assessments done in the region.
- b. Ascertain the following: (1) the data attributes captured for identification such as data fields, standards, and formats, whether they are mandatory or not; (2) the biometrics standards and formats, level/compliance with international open standards such as the ISO 19794, ICAO; (3) the authentication options i.e. the existence of API for online authentication and data verification, its use by service providers as well as its popular use; (4) bar code details what it captures, format/standards, mode of signature, including features i.e. face, fingerprint etc; (5) the use of ID systems/credentials for service delivery the uses in different online/offline scenarios, in person and remote service access options; and (6) the technical readiness, i.e., the feasibility of the ID systems to implement API/web services/service-oriented architecture in each country.
- c. Ascertain the existence of a national digital ID interoperability framework for government data and a national data exchange solution in each country.
- d. Present and undertake an analysis of the existing legal and institutional ID systems management capacities i.e., the legal framework for digital ID, the data protection and cybersecurity laws and authorities, the operational and technical practices in place in each country.
- e. Indicate and analyse the ID systems governance and coordination mechanisms, authorities, and structures, including the operating non-state actors and development partners in each country to ascertain of effectiveness of management approach in place.
- f. Elaborate the near term plans relevant for defining roadmap and strategy from financial, contractual, technical, and institutional perspectives.

- g. Combined with the situational analysis of the *f*ID systems, the governance and coordination mechanism, assess the functional public and private services in the fifteen (15) Member States with the goal of conducting the analysis for interoperability and mutual recognition inherent in the digital solutions for service delivery in each Member State.
- h. Based on the above tasks, elaborate an assessment and analysis report of ECOWAS Member States National Identity Ecosystems. This assessment will support the development of a regional strategy and cross-border roadmap for interoperability and mutual recognition of fID credentials for access to services.

15.2 Phase 2: Regional Strategy for *f*ID systems Interoperability and Mutual Recognition of *f*ID Credentials for Access to Services

- a. Following the assessments above and extensive stakeholders' consultations, elaborate a strategy demonstrating a probable technical architectural, workflow authentication process, attributes exchange, authorisation, and transactions completion pathway solutions enabling service delivery between the Member States identity systems and the identified or recommended services that will facilitate interoperability and mutual recognition for access to services. This aspect of the assignment should take into consideration the data standards and attributes collection being implemented by the WURI participating Member States as well as global experiences of cases of cross-border national ID systems mutual recognition for services accessibility.
- b. The Strategy should respect each Member State's particularities and allow ownership of identity management databases and designed in a such a manner that it builds on and/or recognises the foundations laid by the WURI participating Member States and mechanisms are provided that allow other Member States to join when they are ready. In the instances of inadequately developed systems at respective Member States level, propose the requirement and sustainable solutions based on the principles of identification for development.
- c. Where existing structures within the WURI participating Member States fall short of meeting the pre-requisite for cross-border *f*ID system mutual recognition, the strategy should propose an architectural solution with at least three (3) accessible and viable technology and open-source software solutions that can be applied in delivering the regional *f*ID systems mutual recognition agenda. Present a detailed analysis of each of the three options, highlighting their applicability, lessons learnt from their use, the merits and drawbacks of each option considered, with the aim of identifying the best approach and options for the ECOWAS region.

- d. Proffer recommendations on the priority services to be targeted for cross-border interoperability and mutual recognition of *f*ID systems, based on those identified through the stakeholder consultations. The prioritisation and feasibility analysis should also consider if the essential enablers are in place to facilitate the interoperability and/or mutual recognition. This may entail amongst others, the availability of the infrastructural, human, and institutional support and capacity as well as local political support. With regards to prioritised services that do not meet the pre-requisites, the analysis should indicate the existing gaps and proffer appropriate recommendations for filling these gaps.
- e. Map out viable optimal implementation modalities and approaches that can be deployed by the WURI participating Member States and prepare a corresponding detailed phased and agile implementation plan, inclusive of a monitoring and evaluation framework for the selected implementation modalities and technology solution(s) noting the requirements, outputs and outcomes that are expected at the different stages of implementation. The framework should also include the key indicators and metrics to be used to track progress.

15.3 Phase 3: Roadmap for Cross-border *f*ID systems Interoperability and Mutual Recognition of *f*ID Credentials for Access to Services

- a. Based on the above, and focusing on the WURI implementing Member States, prepare a clear plan/schedule for delivering on the cross-border interoperability and mutual recognition of *f*ID systems for accessing the priority services identified.
- b. Indicate the relevant development agencies that can be engaged for potential partnerships and the areas of involvement in deepening the integration and inclusion agenda. Further, as technology is constantly evolving, bring to light the emerging new opportunities that can support the delivery of the programme.

15.4 General considerations

- a. The assignment may draw insight from the European Union's experience with the eIDAS and other regional blocks such as the East African Community and Smart Africa that offer important guidance as to how variations should not impede cooperation but rather encourage innovation and adaptation of systems functionality and versatility.
- b. The document should be developed bearing in mind the broader African Union Interoperability Framework for Digital Identification and relevant existing *f*ID systems interoperability and mutual recognition in the continent.

- c. The Firm will be required to present the Assessment and Analysis Report, Strategy and Roadmap to the ECOWAS Commission and the World Bank for comments. The document will be shared with the Member States for review, following which the Firm will incorporate all salient contributions into the document.
- d. Furthermore, the Firm will be required to present the document for validation at regional experts and ministerial stakeholders' consultations and equally lead technical regional consensus-building and knowledge-sharing consultations/workshops on the regional and cross-border *f*ID systems interoperability and mutual recognition for access to services. The costs associated with these latter participations are exclusive of the contract associated with this assignment.

E. Methodology

- 16. The Firm is expected to provide a detailed methodology for the assignment. The below listed are merely part of the elements of the methodology.
- 17. Following selection and engagement of the firm, it will be essential to understand and hold consultations with the WURI participating Member States to facilitate the concretisation of the work plans and missions of the firm to the Member States. To facilitate better understanding of the project, the Firm will work closely with the Project Implementing Units at the Commission and will consult the project implementing teams of the Member States and the World Bank WURI team.
- 18. It is crucial that all the experts who will undertake field missions should be on the same level of understanding of the task. To this end, the experts will be required to intermittently regroup and reassess the overall task under the leadership of the Project Coordinator to ensure harmony and consistency of the deliverables. These sessions may involve the participation of the World Bank expert(s) on WURI programme interoperability framework.
- 19. Preparation in each country's official language, of country specificities-sensitive assessment questionnaires that will be sent to each country's institutions and/or entities. Assessment questionnaires should be sent to the appropriate Agencies at least two (2) weeks prior to arrival of the firm representatives in the respective Member States.

F. Deliverables

20. The key deliverables for the Firm include the following:

- a. An inception report detailing an outline of the document, the conceptual framework, methodology, phases of the assignment, work plan, timeframe and milestones leading to the deliverables and assessment questionnaires. The assessment questionnaires for the national institutions translated in the official language applicable to the recipient Member States of the countries in scope of the assignment;
- b. A draft document consisting of three parts: (i) Assessment and Analysis of ECOWAS Member States National Identity Ecosystems, (ii) Regional Strategy for *f*ID systems Interoperability and Mutual Recognition of *f*ID Credentials for Access to Services, and (iii) Roadmap for Cross-border *f*ID systems Interoperability and Mutual Recognition of *f*ID Credentials for Access to Services. This is inclusive of the comments' matrix and resolution report of the feedback based on the review by the ECOWAS Commission, the World Bank and the WURI participating Member States Technical Committee;
- c. A final regionally validated report consisting of An Assessment and Analysis Report, Strategy and Roadmap of not more seventy (70) pages in English language, to be submitted to the ECOWAS Commission after incorporating all salient contributions from ECOWAS Commission, the World Bank, and the Regional Stakeholders Validation Meetings;
- d. The following annexes should be attached to the final report:
 - A comprehensive list of stakeholders consulted in the course of the assignment.
 - Assessment questionnaires and responses report of each of the Member States.
 - All data and references consulted.
 - Any other material that is relevant to the report.
- e. Upon conclusion of the regional experts and ministerial stakeholders' consultations, prepare and deliver a detailed report and an abridged version on the outcome of each of the regional consultations for the ECOWAS Parliament and Council of Ministers. The abridged version should not be more than five (5) pages. These reports will serve the purpose of briefing the bodies on the outcomes of the process for the regionalisation of the initiative;
- f. All documents are to be submitted in soft copy and editable format.

G. Supervision Arrangement

21. The Firm will work under the supervision of the Project Coordinator/ECOWAS Director Free Movement of Persons and Migration. Therefore, the Director has oversight over the delivery of this assignment. 22. The ECOWAS Directorate of Free Movement of Persons and Migration should be contacted on all matters relating to this assignment. The Directorate will facilitate contact with the World Bank when necessary as well as the Member States through the ECOWAS National Offices which shall provide in-country support in facilitating access to relevant stakeholders to be consulted.

H. Contract Duration

- 23. The contract duration will be for a period of four (4) months.
- 24. The periods are inclusive of all travel, submissions of draft documents, revisions and submission of final documents, participation at the validation workshop and the review and official submission of the Final documents by the Firm.
- 25. The final document MUST be available latest four (4) months following the signature of the contract.

I. Payment

- 26. Payments shall include the professional fees and other travel-related cost (economy tickets). Payment shall be based on accomplishment of specific assignment as indicated below which must be attached per payment call:
 - i. 25% of the total remuneration to be paid upon validation of inception report indicating the outline of the document, conceptual framework, methodology, phases of the assignment, work plan, timing, assessment questionnaires, financial proposal and milestones leading to the deliverables.
 - ii. 30% to be paid upon production of the *"Revised Draft Assessment and Analysis Report, Strategy and Roadmap document"* accepted and approved by the ECOWAS Commission and the World Bank.
 - iii. 45% to be paid upon completion and submission of the final validated document, annexes, and regional consultation outcome reports mentioned in (e) deliverable above.
 - iv. All payments per call shall be made upon presentation of actual supporting documents to that effect at the end of the specific call.

J. Desired Qualifications and Experience

- The Firm must possess at least ten (10) years' cognate experience leading in digital transformation projects, including in sub-Saharan Africa.
- It must indicate strong technical knowledge of e-government and experience in planning and implementing projects relating to the digitization of large public and

private service delivery, including the completion of at least two (2) similar assignments.

- The Firm must demonstrate adequacy of human resource for undertaking the assignment, with each involved expert possessing at least a Bachelor's Degree in ICT or related field and five (5) years of relevant experience. Master's Degree is preferable.
- The experts undertaking the mission to the Member State must possess the ability to conduct consultations in the official language of the country assigned.
- Each involved expert must prove the ability to engage effectively with a broad spectrum of stakeholders in the ICT field and public sector or in leading related multi-stakeholders' engagement and consultations.
- The experts must possess experience in preparing strategy, technical analysis, and solution architectures for large-scale digital identification and e-governance projects.
- They must possess knowledge/experience of regional interoperability of systems, eIDAS etc.
- They should equally possess the ability to elicit information from various stakeholders and articulate their submissions into project implementable recommendations.
- Knowledge of any of the other official languages of ECOWAS will be an advantage.
- Knowledge of ECOWAS and its Member States will be an added advantage.

K. How to Apply

- 27. Interested Firms that meet the above-listed requirement are invited to submit their Expression of Interest to the **Procurement Division, ECOWAS Commission, 101 Yakubu Gowon Crescent, Asokoro, Abuja, Nigeria** in sealed envelopes with the subject line "West Africa Unique Identification for Regional Integration and Inclusion Project: Assessment and Development of a Regional Strategy and a Roadmap for Cross-border fID Systems Interoperability and Mutual Recognition of fID Credentials for Access to Services".
- 28. For an application to be considered valid, it must contain the following: (1) company profile, (2) company certificate of registration, (3) a self-declaration from the Firm to the effect that no partner of the Firm has been found guilty of professional/other misconduct by any institution, (4) Detailed citation of the Firm's relevant experience, (5) curricula vitae of the experts who will undertake field missions, demonstrating the relevant qualifications and experience, (6) Functional e-mail address and, mobile number of the Firm, (7) The outline of the document, conceptual framework, methodology, phases of the assignment, work plan, timeframe and milestones leading to the deliverables, (8) A financial proposal for undertaking the assignment quoted in US Dollars. Both the financial proposal and technical proposal should be submitted together, but in separate sealed envelopes.

- 29. Selection of successful applications will be based on Selection of successful applications will be based on consultant's qualification.
- 30. Please be informed that the Consultancy will be executed in accordance with the Bank's "<u>Procurement</u> Regulations for IPF Borrowers" dated July 2016 revised on November 2017 ("Procurement Regulations"), which can be found at the following website: <u>www.worldbank.org</u>..

Please note that only applications that meet the requirement will be accepted and only those shortlisted will be contacted.